Cause No. D-1-GN-20-000941

FRIENDS OF DRY COMAL CREEK	§
and STOP 3009 VULCAN QUARRY,	§
Plaintiffs,	§
v.	§ IN THE DISTRICT COURT OF
	§ TRAVIS COUNTY, TEXAS
TEXAS COMMISSION ON	§ 353RD JUDICIAL DISTRICT
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY,	§
Defendant	§
and	§
	§
VULCAN CONSTRUCTION	§
MATERIALS, LLC,	§
Defendant-Intervenor	§

FINAL JUDGMENT

On December 8, 2020, came on to be heard this matter. All parties appeared through counsel and announced ready, and the administrative record was admitted into evidence.

Based on the pleadings, the administrative record, the parties' briefs and the parties' arguments, it is the opinion of the Court that the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality's November 21, 2019, "ORDER GRANTING THE APPLICATION BY VULCAN CONSTRUCTION MATERIALS, LLC FOR PERMIT NO. 147392L001; TCEQ DOCKET NO. 2018-1303-AIR; SOAH DOCKET NO. 582-19-1955" ("Final Order") should be REVERSED in part and REMANDED.

The Court finds and rules as follows:

1. TCEQ's Conclusion of Law No. 12 (concluding that there is no indication that emissions from the plant will contravene the intent of the Texas Clean Air Act, including the protection of the public's health and physical property) is reversed because i) TCEQ's determination that the Plant's crystalline silica emissions will not negatively affect human health or welfare is not supported by substantial evidence; ii) Vulcan's silica emissions

calculations are not based on representative site conditions, and TCEQ's determination that Vulcan's silica emissions calculations are representative of those to be expected from the site is not supported by substantial evidence; and iii) TCEQ's rejection of Reeh Plaintiffs' assertions regarding ways the Permit allegedly is not sufficiently protective of public health or property is arbitrary and capricious and not supported by substantial evidence.

- 2. TCEQ's Conclusion of Law No. 14 (concluding that Vulcan has made all demonstrations required under applicable statutes and regulations, including 30 Texas Administrative Code § 116.111 regarding air permit applications, to be issued an air quality permit with conditions as set forth in the Draft Permit) is reversed because i) TCEQ's determination that Vulcan's air dispersion modeling adequately accounts for or addresses cumulative impacts; ii) TCEQ's determination that quarry and road emissions were adequately considered; and iii) TCEQ's determination that Vulcan's choice of the relevant background concentrations used in its voluntary Full Minor National Ambient Air Quality Standard ("NAAQS") Analyses were appropriate, is arbitrary and capricious, and not supported by substantial evidence.
- 3. TCEQ's Best Available Control Technology ("BACT") reviews for Vulcan's Application met the standards of Texas Health and Safety Code § 382.0518 and 30 Texas Administrative Code § 116.11l(a)(2)(C), were properly conducted, supported by substantial evidence, and not arbitrary, capricious, or unlawful. TCEQ's BACT determination is affirmed.

4. The Administrative Law Judge abused her discretion by ruling that Vulcan could maintain

information from its 2016 subsurface investigation at the property where the Plant will be

located as confidential under the trade secret privilege.

5. Plaintiffs were denied due process such that their substantial rights were prejudiced by: (1)

the Administrative Law Judge's ruling that Vulcan could maintain information from its

2016 subsurface investigation at the property where the Plant will be located as confidential

under the trade secret privilege; (2) the Administrative Law Judge's denial of Plaintiffs'

discovery and cross-examination of the "privileged" information; and (3) TCEQ's not

requiring Vulcan to input emissions from quarries and roads into its modeling for the AQAs

for 24-hour PM₁₀, 24-hour PM_{2.5}, and Annual PM_{2.5}.

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED that the Final Order is

AFFIRMED IN PART and REVERSED IN PART and REMANDED.

Signed this 1st day of April

Approved as to form only:

David Frederick

Perales, Allmon & Ice, P.C.

Counsel for Friends of Dry Comal Creek and Stop 3009 Vulcan Quarry

Mark A. Steinbach, by Dop-Mark A. Steinbach With rosesent

Erin K. Snody Office of The Attorney General

Counsel for Texas Commission on Environmental Quality

Keith A. Courtney
Michael A. Shaunessy
Derek L. Seal
Mcginnis Lochridge LLP

Counsel for Vulcan Construction Materials, LLC

James D. Bradbury

Courtney Cox Smith

James D. Bradbury, PLLC

Counsel for Jeffrey Reeh, Terry Olson, Mike Olson, and Comal Independent School District

Mark A. Steinbach Erin K. Snody Office of The Attorney General

Counsel for Texas Commission on Environmental Quality

Keith A. Courtney

Michael A. Shaunessy

Derek L. Seal

Mcginnis Lochridge LLP

Counsel for Vulcan Construction Materials, LLC

James D. Bradbury

Courtney Cox Smith

James D. Bradbury, PLLC

Counsel for Jeffrey Reeh, Terry Olson, Mike Olson, and Comal Independent School District

Mark A. Steinbach
Erin K. Snody
Office of The Attorney General

Counsel for Texas Commission on Environmental Quality

Keith A. Courtney
Michael A. Shaunessy
Derek L. Seal
Mcginnis Lochridge LLP

Counsel for Vulcan Construction Materials, LLC

James D. Bradbury

Courtney Cox Smith

James D. Bradbury, PLLC

Counsel for Jeffrey Reeh, Terry Olson, Mike Olson, and Comal Independent School District